AP® European History
Sample Student Responses and Scoring Commentary

Inside:

- Long Essay Question 3
- ✅ Scoring Guideline
- ✅ Student Samples
- ✅ Scoring Commentary

© 2021 College Board. College Board, Advanced Placement, AP, AP Central, and the acorn logo are registered trademarks of College Board. Visit College Board on the web: collegeboard.org.
AP Central is the official online home for the AP Program: apcentral.collegeboard.org.
Evaluate the most significant effect of the Enlightenment on European society during the period 1688 to 1815.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting Category</th>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Row A</strong> Thesis/Claim (0–1 points)</td>
<td>0 points Does not meet the criteria for one point.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 point</td>
<td>Responds to the prompt with a historically defensible thesis/claim that establishes a line of reasoning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Decision Rules and Scoring Notes

**Responses that do not earn this point:**
- Are not historically defensible.
- Only restate or rephrase the prompt.
- Do not respond to the prompt.
- Do not establish a line of reasoning.
- Are overgeneralized.

**Responses that earn this point:**
- Provide a historically defensible thesis or claim about the most significant effect of the Enlightenment in the period from 1688 to 1815. The thesis or claim must either provide some indication of the reasoning for making that claim OR establish the analytic categories of the argument.

**Examples that do not earn this point:**
- Do not focus on the topic of the prompt
  - "The most significant effect of the Enlightenment was to establish a ruling elite of scientists and intellectuals in the period 1688 to 1815."
- Do not focus on the topic of the prompt
  - "The most significant reason for the popularity of Enlightenment thought was the advancements of the Scientific Revolution.”

**Examples that earn this point:**
- Establish a line of reasoning that evaluates the topic of the prompt
  - "The most significant effect of Enlightenment thought on European society was a series of attempts to change government and the social order using rational principles.”
  - "The most important effect was the idea of individual liberty, which led to revolutions against monarchy.”
- Establish a line of reasoning that evaluates the topic of the prompt with analytic categories
  - "Enlightenment ideas about liberty and rationality led some Europeans to try to gradually reform society and led others to violently overthrow existing regimes.”

**Establish a line of reasoning**
- "The Enlightenment emphasis on reason challenged political ideas based on religious faith.” (Minimally acceptable thesis/claim)
- "The Enlightenment’s most important political effect was its encouragement of the French Revolution.” (Minimally acceptable thesis/claim)

**Additional Notes:**
- The thesis or claim must consist of one or more sentences located in one place, either in the introduction or the conclusion (which may not be limited to the first or last paragraphs).
- The thesis or claim must identify a relevant development(s) in the period, although it is not required to encompass the entire period.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting Category</th>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contextualization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(0–1 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Scoring Criteria**

- **0 points**: Does not meet the criteria for one point.
- **1 point**: Describes a broader historical context relevant to the prompt.

**Decision Rules and Scoring Notes**

### Responses that do not earn this point:

- Provide an overgeneralized statement about the time period referenced in the prompt.
- Provide context that is not relevant to the prompt.
- Provide a passing phrase or reference.

### Examples that do not earn this point:

- Provide overly generalized attempts at contextualization
  - “Europe was undergoing many cultural changes in the period 1688 to 1815.”

- Provide a passing phrase or reference
  - “The Enlightenment was a significant intellectual movement in the 1700s.”

### Responses that earn this point:

- Accurately describe a context relevant to the effects of the Enlightenment on European society.

### Examples of relevant context that earn this point include the following, if appropriate elaboration is provided:

- Scientific Revolution
- Divine-right monarchies
- Rise of new social classes such as professionals and merchants
- Increased literacy and access to education in Europe
- Public discussion of new philosophies (Locke/Rousseau)
- Absolutist regimes in Europe
- Protestant Reformation and Catholic Counter-Reformation
- Joseph II and emancipatory thought

### Example of acceptable contextualization:

- “The advances of the Scientific Revolution established a new way of looking at the natural world, which Enlightenment thinkers began to apply to human society.”
- “The rise of commerce and the money economy in Europe created influential new groups that sought to challenge established aristocracies for political power.”

### Additional Notes:

- The response must relate the topic of the prompt to broader historical events, developments, or processes that occur before, during, or continue after the time frame of the question.
- To earn this point, the context provided must be more than a phrase or reference.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting Category</th>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Row C Evidence (0–2 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 points</td>
<td>Does not meet the criteria for one point.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 point</td>
<td>Provides specific examples of evidence relevant to the topic of the prompt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 points</td>
<td>Supports an argument in response to the prompt using specific and relevant examples of evidence.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Decision Rules and Scoring Notes

**Responses that do not earn points:**
- Identify a single piece of evidence.
- Provide evidence that is not relevant to the topic of prompt.
- Provide evidence that is outside the time period or region specified in the prompt.
- Repeat information that is specified in the prompt.

**Responses that earn 1 point:**
- Identify at least two specific historical examples relevant to the topic of effects of the Enlightenment on European society in the period 1688 to 1815.

**Examples of evidence that are specific and relevant include the following (two examples required):**
- Locke’s and Rousseau’s ideas regarding the social contract
- Voltaire’s skepticism regarding religious and political institutions
- Policies of enlightened despots like Catherine the Great
- Enlightenment proposals regarding education such as Rousseau’s *Emile*
- *Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen*
- Haitian Revolution
- Enlightenment-influenced policies of the French Revolutionary governments (e.g., abolition of hereditary privileges, calendar reform, metric system, Cult of the Supreme Being
- *Glorious Revolution*
- Development of deism
- Impact of scientific inventions or discoveries furthering Enlightenment thinking

**Example of a statement that earns one point for evidence:**
- “The universal principles of the *Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen* and the Haitian Revolution’s rejection of slavery as unnatural both show the effect of the Enlightenment.”

**Examples that successfully support an argument with evidence:**
- “Voltaire’s popular satire *Candide* attacked religious beliefs and institutions such as the Inquisition, claiming they resulted from irrational superstition.” (Uses specific pieces of evidence to support the argument that the Enlightenment led to a decline in religious belief)
- “Enlightenment reformers hoped to reorganize society and government on more rational principles. John Locke claimed that government should express the popular will or be changed. Adam Smith argued that governments should not interfere in the natural process of people meeting their own needs and wants in the market.” (Uses evidence to support the argument about the effects of the Enlightenment)

**Examples that do not earn points:**
- Provide evidence that is outside the time period
- “Hobbes’ idea that society was formed out of fear of being dominated challenged the idea of divinely ordained authority.”

**Additional Notes:**
- Typically, statements credited as evidence will be more specific than statements credited as contextualization.
- If a response has a multipart argument, then it can meet the threshold of two pieces of evidence by giving one example for one part of the argument and another example for a different part of the argument, but the total number of examples must still be at least two.
### Reporting Category

**Analysis and Reasoning (0–2 points)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Points</th>
<th>Scoring Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0 points</td>
<td>Does not meet the criteria for one point.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 point</td>
<td>Uses historical reasoning (e.g., comparison, causation, continuity and change) to frame or structure an argument that addresses the prompt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 points</td>
<td>Demonstrates a complex understanding of the historical development that is the focus of the prompt, using evidence to corroborate, qualify, or modify an argument that addresses the question.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Decision Rules and Scoring Notes

**Responses that do not earn points:**
- May include evidence but offer no reasoning to connect the evidence to an argument.
- May assert the use of historical reasoning but do not use it to frame or structure an argument.

**Examples that do not earn points:**
- Provide evidence but offer no reasoning to connect the evidence to an argument.
  - “There were all kinds of reforms that happened to improve people’s lives both in daily life and in work life, like factory reform bills and child labor reforms.”

**Responses that earn 1 point:**
- Must demonstrate the use of historical reasoning to explain the effects of the Enlightenment on European society in the period 1688 to 1815, although the reasoning may be uneven, limited, or imbalanced.

**Using a historical thinking skill to frame or structure an argument could include:**
- Using causal reasoning to explain significant cultural or intellectual effects of the Enlightenment and how those contributed to political changes.
- Structuring an argument thematically to consider different subcategories of the effects of the Enlightenment (e.g., reform vs. revolution).
- Distinguishing the most significant effects in different geographic areas.
- Structuring an argument logically to consider the merits of alternative possibilities as the most important effect.
- Arranging an argument as a chronological narrative of developments over the course of the period showing change over time.

**Example of acceptable use of historical reasoning:**
- “Enlightenment thinkers derided existing religious traditions and also tried to establish what they considered to be a more reasonable form of religious belief.” (Establishes two categories of effects. The statement would need to be followed with at least a minimal elaboration of this reasoning.)
- “In the early part of the period Enlightenment thinkers proposed theoretical changes to make government and society more rational, but later attempted to put their theories into action.” (Identifies both causation and references change over time in the discussion of significant effects of the Enlightenment. This statement would need to be followed with at least a minimal elaboration of this reasoning.)

**Responses that earn 2 points:**
- May demonstrate a complex understanding in a variety of ways, such as:
  - Explaining the nuance of an issue by analyzing multiple variables.
  - Explaining both similarity and difference, or explaining both continuity and change, or explaining multiple causes, or explaining both causes and effects.
  - Explaining relevant and insightful connections within and across periods.
  - Confirming the validity of an argument by corroborating multiple perspectives across themes.
  - Qualifying or modifying an argument by considering diverse or alternative views or evidence.

**Demonstrating complex understanding might include any of the following, if appropriate elaboration is provided:**
- Evaluating whether the religious changes associated with the Enlightenment had more significant effects than nonreligious aspects of the Enlightenment. (Modifies or qualifies an argument)
- Evaluating different effects of the Enlightenment in different regions of Europe (e.g., contrasting the Enlightenment’s effects in Britain vs. its effects in France). (Explains nuance, multiple variables)
- Explaining the changing influence of the Enlightenment over the course of the period or considering its continued influence into the 19th century. (Provides insightful connections within and across periods. Note that discussion of post-1815 would need to be more than a passing reference to count as complexity.)
- Considering the interrelationship between religious and political effects of the Enlightenment. (Confirms the validity of an argument by corroborating multiple perspectives across themes)
- Considering the ongoing impact of science, politics, and religion in public discourse across periods. (Provides insightful connections within and across periods)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Additional Notes:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• This demonstration of complex understanding must be part of the argument, not merely a phrase or reference.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Age of Reason of the Enlightened featured the breakdown of traditional concepts in favor of change and challenges to the government. The Agricultural and Scientific Revolutions of the 17th century featured new technology and discoveries that shifted the European mindset, making devices such as the seed drill and new theories such as the heliocentric theory challenge ancient authorities' ways and traditional ideas. Political turmoil also favored an intellectual shift as absolute monarchs such as in England were challenged in the English Civil War, leading to Parliament's control after the Glorious Revolution of 1688. The application of Scientific method and reasonism on human and social issues became the Enlightenment, with its challenges to views on politics, economics, and societal matters. Although the Enlightenment had an impact on economics, art, consumer culture and social issues and philosophy, the most significant effect of the Enlightenment was its political discussion that influenced revolutions and Enlightened absolutism in European society during 1688-1815.

The Enlightenment philosophers and ideas had tremendous impact on society. New ideas of government, such as Montesquieu’s separation of powers and Voltaire’s Enlightened Monarchy, went against the absolute regimes of the time and caused
people to advocate for their rights. Rousseau’s idea of popular sovereignty based on the general will of the population also fostered political change. Other political works such as Diderot’s Encyclopedia and Spirit of the Laws by Montesquieu encouraged political discussion, which spread from France to other nations and from coffeehouse to coffeehouse, karaoké to karaoké. The salons hosted by women, such as Madame de Geoffrin, were particularly helpful with the dissemination of Enlightenment texts and ideas. These political effects reflect the secularism of the Enlightenment starting with Retrach’s political dialogues and Machiavelli’s The Prince, making the Enlightenment a continuity in politics and government-centered focus on society.

Another major effect of the Enlightenment’s political importance is the revolutionary sentiment it caused in society. Enlightenment ideals and concepts of reason, nature, progress, liberty, and happiness had spread to America, causing the American Revolution against the oppressive British. The success of these Enlightenment ideas are shown in the Declaration of Rights signed by men influenced by politically challenging ideas of the Enlightenment, making people in France wonder. On top of social
The inequality of the social system and the financial debt France had gotten from Louis XIV's wars and lavish spending influenced the political concepts of the Enlightenment. The Estates-General also influenced the start of the French Revolution as members of the Third Estate called for more political representation at the end of the 18th century. This led to The Estates-General's failure in its purpose as votes were still casted by order, not head, leading to the creation of the National Assembly and more rights that Enlightenment individualists such as Locke had called for. The equality and liberty advocated by these individuals would become a reality as the National Assembly made everyone a citizen and got rid of the aristocracy. The abolition of the old social system, including the privileges of the nobility, can be connected to the liberal reforms movements of the 19th century, which called for basic rights and freedoms amid conservatism and the controversial conditions of the Industrial Revolution. Also, the Enlightenment's concepts of liberty and happiness can be seen in women's movements (suffragists) to get the right to vote as well as the division of political parties then and now over what these rights and liberties should be. Enlightened Absolutism is also an effect of political discussion as monarchs such as Frederick
Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

Frederick II even declared that he was the “first servant of the state” while Catherine restricted them. Catherine even had connections with Enlightenment figures such as Diderot. Joseph II of Austria was an enlightened monarch as well with his domestic reform, and even Napoleon Bonaparte practiced religious toleration and confirmed peasant gains and granted amnesty of nobles to institute more equality.

The Enlightenment also had on a string less significant effect on economics and social issues with the physiocrats. Adam Smith advocated for a laissez-faire economy with free economic pursuit of economic self-interest, while Malthus and Ricardo had thoughts on the population vs. the food supply and wages (iron law of rents), respectively. While these ideas had an impact on European society and shaped the consumer culture of the 18th century, they had their limits. The laissez-faire would be displaced by much needed government intervention during the 19th century as industrial conditions made workers unhappy, and Malthus’ ideas were not very accurate. Social and philosophical matters were addressed, such as Beccaria’s advocacy for much less torture in Crimes and Punishments and Hume’s
thoughts on emotions, but there had never been so
the impact the political concepts had on European
society. Politics and ideological conflict would
also be more prevalent in the Cold War of the
20th century as Communism and capitalism became
central to the war's impact, and opposing country
tried to limit the government's influence more than the
economic influence.

The Enlightenment's most significant effect
on European society in the political challenges it
encouraged against absolutist governments and the
discussion of liberty it influenced, not the econom-
ics or social matters it affected. This is because of
the revolutions the political concepts would influence,
causing a shift in the balance of power (Congress of
Vienna) and future movements of liberal reform
and government challenges of socialism and another
it caused. The Enlightenment ability to challenge
existing governments would even cause for people
today to refer to any challenge to traditional
standards as "Enlightenment."
Begin your response to each question at the top of a new page. Do not skip lines.

The Enlightenment emerged as an evolution of European thought exposed in the Renaissance. Secularism was expanded upon as it had ushered in the Italian Renaissance. The Enlightenment was an extension of previous beliefs but also added more to the table. It made thought more scientific and challenged existing institutions such as the clergy. But its greatest effect can be seen in its effect on political thought. This is exemplified by the invention of Enlightenment political thought, its role in the French Revolution and its application in the United States and its challenge to social order.

Enlightenment thought changed how political discourse would be conducted thereafter. With questions of government based on religion being thrust out in favor of secular government forms. The teachings of Locke and Hobbes replaced the idea of divine right with ideas on natural, human rights and thus secularizing the justification kings used to rule.

Ideas of separation of powers like those of Montesquieu and of ideas of religious tolerance like Voltaire also became mainstream with this they way people talked about politics changed drastically. Showing how the most significant effect of the Enlightenment was its complete change of politics. For now, rulers would need to abide by these completely different rules to secure justification for their reigns and support of the people.

Its application in the French Revolution show this significance as well. For it was with these ideals that the Republicanism
decided to form a new government. It was using the Ideas of Natural Rights that the French revolutionaries wrote the declaration of the rights of man and established and justifed their rule. This spread also to areas the French conquered and caused a massive expansion of these ideas to Germany, Belgium, Italy and many other places.

This means the French revolution could be considered the enlightenment thought in practice. It was by the virtue of disrupting European society and radically altering France and its neighbors that we see how the political effect of the Enlightenment was the most significant.

In general, we can sum this all up as the Enlightenment's political aspect challenging what Europe was and proposing what it could be. The political side of the Enlightenment, more than the social or economic side, completely challenged European authority. It challenged the long-standing institutions of the clergy, the aristocracy and the Kings. While at the same time forcing them to justify themselves to Enlightenment thinkers. Thus its challenge to what was established meant that it provided a catalyst for revolutionary change and social disruption which would culminate in the French revolution and beyond. This symbolizes how the most significant effect of the Enlightenment was in its political aspect due to how much at a damage to European balance it was.
The most significant effect of the Enlightenment was how everyone started thinking differently. Once the enlightenment happened, people started thinking more logically and looked for facts. People decided that everything can be explained. This is very different coming from the witch trials. You didn't need any evidence to accuse someone of being a witch. Many innocent people died because of this. But now people began to understand you had to have evidence and think logically.

Another big way the Enlightenment affected things was the French Revolution. The Enlightenment is one of the main reasons the French Revolution happened. Because people started to have no ideas and realized how unfair the three estates general was. The third estate which consisted of 97% of the population could never win.

One other way the Enlightenment influenced people was that new governments were formed. Constitutions were created and fixed so that people could have more freedom. After the French Revolution, they gained
the Declaration of the Rights of Man. This gave men the right to vote.

One other way the Enlightenment had a big effect on how people thought was with money. People began to trade more causing the commercial revolution. This helped expand and renew countries. David Ricardo even came up with comparative advantage. And many more things were invented or created to improve our world.

People can say that the most important part of the Enlightenment was the inventions it created. But those inventions wouldn't have even existed if people didn't start thinking differently. It was when people researched and opened their minds to new possibilities did the inventions come to pass.
Question 3 — Long Essay Question

Note: Student samples are quoted verbatim and may contain spelling and grammatical errors.

Overview

The LEQ asked students to establish an historically defensible argument; to situate an event or historical process in context; to utilize specific pieces of relevant historical evidence; to demonstrate historical reasoning skills; and to use the evidence to corroborate, qualify, or modify an argument that addresses the question. In this LEQ responses were expected to demonstrate historical reasoning, specifically by analyzing the most significant effect of the historical event of the Enlightenment during the period 1688–1815 (Key Concepts 2.3 and 2.1). Responses were expected to describe a broader historical context relevant to the emergence and effects of the Enlightenment in European history, to provide specific examples of evidence relevant to the prompt, and to support an argument or arguments in the response using specific and relevant examples of evidence. Finally, responses were expected to frame or to structure an argument about the most significant effect of the Enlightenment using historical thinking skills (e.g., contextualization, making connections, and argumentation [Skills 4.A–B, 5.A–B, and 6.A–D]) and historical reasoning skills (e.g., causation and change and continuity over time [Reasoning Processes 2.i–v and 3.i–iii]). Responses also had to demonstrate a complex understanding of the effect of the Enlightenment by using evidence to corroborate, qualify, or modify an argument. Responses were assessed on the extent to which they performed in the following four categories: thesis and/or claim, contextualization, evidence, and analysis and reasoning.

Sample: 3A
Score: 6

Thesis/Claim: 1
Contextualization: 1
Evidence: 2
Analysis and Reasoning: 2

A. Thesis/Claim (0–1 points): 1

The response earned 1 point for the thesis in the first paragraph because it identifies a significant factor (political discussion) and establishes a line of reasoning (discussions leading to revolutions and the end of absolutism).

B. Contextualization (0–1 points): 1

The response earned 1 point for contextualization in the first paragraph by situating Enlightenment thought as a trend emerging after the Agricultural and Scientific Revolutions and then discussing the effects of Enlightenment thought on society.

C. Evidence (0–2 points): 2

Providing Specific Examples of Evidence

The response earned 1 point for specific evidence by using two relevant pieces of evidence (Montesquieu’s separation of powers and Voltaire’s Enlightened monarchy) in the second paragraph.

Using Specific Evidence in Support of a Relevant Argument

The response earned 1 point for using evidence in support of an argument by providing evidence in every
Question 3 — Long Essay Question (continued)

paragraph to support arguments. The second paragraph earned the point for considering the public appetite for knowledge and the distribution of that knowledge. It continues to further the argument by using outside evidence (Diderot, etc.). Paragraph 3 also earned the point by linking aspects of the French Revolution to specific Enlightenment philosophies and subsequent movements like women’s suffrage. The fourth paragraph also contains evidence (Ricardo, Smith) used to support an argument about material conditions and change in economic thought.

D. Analysis and Reasoning (0–2 points): 2

Using Historical Reasoning
The response earned 1 point for using historical reasoning to frame a causal argument around the effects of various Enlightenment philosophies on public knowledge, the French Revolution, and enlightened monarchs.

Demonstrating Complex Understanding
The response earned 1 point for demonstrating complex understanding because it successfully draws parallels across regions (Eastern and Western Europe, colonial presence); disciplines (politics and literature); and periods (Enlightenment and post-Enlightenment).

Sample: 3B
Score: 5

Thesis/Claim: 1
Contextualization: 1
Evidence: 2
Analysis and Reasoning: 1

A. Thesis/Claim (0–1 points): 1

The response earned 1 point for the thesis in the first paragraph through its identification of a significant factor (political thought) and a line of reasoning (leading to the French Revolution).

B. Contextualization (0–1 points): 1

The response earned 1 point for contextualization in the first paragraph by situating Enlightenment thought as emerging after the Renaissance, secularism, and continuing challenges to the clergy.

C. Evidence (0–2 points): 2

Providing Specific Examples of Evidence
The response earned 1 point for evidence by using two specific and relevant pieces of evidence (Montesquieu and Voltaire) in paragraph 2.

Using Specific Evidence in Support of a Relevant Argument
The response earned 1 point for using evidence in support of an argument by providing evidence to show how specific political thoughts connected to influential Enlightenment ideas. (Locke, Hobbes, Voltaire in the second paragraph’s consideration of philosophers’ contributions to Enlightenment change.)
Question 3 — Long Essay Question (continued)

D. Analysis and Reasoning (0–2 points): 1

Using Historical Reasoning
The response earned 1 point for using historical reasoning by framing an argument using continuity and change to examine Enlightenment politics and their significance.

Demonstrating Complex Understanding
The response did not earn the point for demonstrating complex understanding because, while it demonstrates historical thinking, the response did not qualify or modify its argument.

Sample: 3C
Score: 1

Thesis/Claim: 0
Contextualization: 0
Evidence: 1
Analysis and Reasoning: 0

Thesis/Claim (0–1 points): 0
The response did not earn the point for thesis because there is no historically defensible claim and no line of reasoning.

B. Contextualization (0–1 points): 0
The response did not earn the point for contextualization because the examples supplied are either inaccurate or do not rise above a passing phrase. While the information on witchcraft is interesting, it is not made relevant to the topic.

C. Evidence (0–2 points): 1

Providing Specific Examples of Evidence
The response earned 1 point for evidence by using two relevant pieces of evidence (the mention of the results of the French Revolution in the third paragraph and the mention of David Ricardo and comparative advantage in the fourth paragraph).

Using Specific Evidence in Support of a Relevant Argument
The response did not earn the point for using specific evidence in support of an argument because it does not use the evidence provided to support an argument.

D. Analysis and Reasoning (0–2 points): 0

Using Historical Reasoning/Demonstrating Complex Understanding
The response did not earn either point for using historical reasoning or demonstrating a complex understanding because there is no structural argument in causality or change over time. The response remains narrative and not persuasive.